BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631444 6

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

PART ONE

1980-1981

with the assistance of
PETER QUANCE

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY
DEC 0 1 1980
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

PART ONE

1980-1981

with the assistance of

PETER QUANCE

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin01maku_0

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

CHAPTER I

Introduction 1

Jarvis, Acting for a Developer 2

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 6

Dupre, Intergovernmental Finance in Ontario: A Provincial-Local Perspective 11

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 16

Notes and Questions 21

CHAPTER II

THE ORGANIZATION OF MUNICIPALITIES

Introduction 22

A. Approaches to Municipal Organization 23

Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government 23

Note 29

1. Municipal Council 30

Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto UPDATE 30

Note 30

2. The Executive 31

(i) The Mayor 31

Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 31

(ii) Reforming the Executive 32

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 32

3.	The Board of Control - Executive Committee	34
	Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government	34
	Note	36
	Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System	36
	Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration	38
4.	The Manager Plan	
	Notes and Questions	40
	Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System	41
5.	Council-City Commissioner System	45
	Plunkett, Burban Canada and Its Government	45
6.	Standing Committees	46
	Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making	46
7.	Approaches to Reform	47
	(i) The Basic Assumption - Policy v. Administration	47
	Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration	47
	Hickey, Decision-Making Processes in Ontario's Local Governments	51
	(ii) The Winnipeg Experience	57
	Proposal for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area	57
	Note	60
	Cook & Feldman, "Approaches to Local Government Reform in Canada: The Case of Winnipeg	61
	Jacobs, The Death and Life of Great American Cities	62
	(iii) A New Suggestion for Toronto	64
	City of Toronto Neighbourhood Services Work Group, Report	64

B. The Reorganization of Municipalities 68

1. The Need for Reform 68

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, In Search of Balance: Canada's Intergovernmental Experience 68

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, Alternative Approaches to Governmental Reorganization in Metropolitan Areas 70

2. Distribution of Responsibilities 75

a) The Metropolitan Toronto Example 75

Note 75

b) Regional Government 76

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 76

Note 84

3. The Problems With Reorganization 84

(i) Boundaries 84

Note 84

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 85

(ii) Special Purpose Bodies 86

Note 86

Bureau of Municipal Research, "The 101 Governments of Metro Toronto" 86

Note 95

Re McAuliffe and Metro Toronto Bd. of Commissioners of Police 95

Note 102

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 102

(iii) Representation 103

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 103

(iv) Intra Regional Conflict 109

Simpson, City Loses Important Votes At First Meeting of Metro Council 109

Globe & Mail, City Decides on Legal Fight over Spadina 109

Globe & Mail, York Joins City in Opposing Spadina Paving 110

Weinstein, "The Effect of the Federal Reapportionment Decisions on Municipal Government" 111

(v) An Alternative: The Winnipeg Experience 112

Proposals for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area 112

Globe & Mail, Assessing the Plan to Reform Winnipeg's Government 116

CHAPTER III

LOCAL GOVERNMENT FINANCING

Introduction 123

A. Introduction 124

1. Municipal Finance Generally 124

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 124

Local Government Finance in Ontario (Ministries of Treasury and Economics & Intergovernmental affairs) 128

2. The Property Tax 136

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 136

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 138

B. Restraints on Municipal Finance 140

1. The Political Process 140

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and The Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 140

Statement by Paul V. Godfrey, President Canadian Federation of Mayors and Municipalities 144

Note 148

2. Legal Restraints 149

Note 149

Re Corporation of the Township of Nepean 149

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 155

City of Toronto v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 161

Re Township of Westminster and City of London 164

Re Victoria Harbour Sewage Service 167

Lewis v. Town of Prescott 172

Note 173

C. Property Tax Assessment 174

1. Who is Liable for Property Taxation 174

Note 174

2. What is Assessable Property 174

Note 174

Northern Broadcasting Co. Ltd. v. Improvement District of Mountjoy 175

Note 178

3. Exemptions From Taxation 179

Note 179

(i) Crown Land 179

Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and Township of Toronto 179

(ii)	Indian Lands	182
	Note	182
(iii)	Places of Worship and Cemetaries	182
	Note	182
	Re Presbyterian Church Building Corp. and Assessment Comm. for Algoma	182
	Re Singh and City of Sudbury	186
	Note	191
(iv)	Public Education Institutions, Philanthropic or Religious Seminaries and Educational Seminaries	192
	Note	192
	Re McMaster University and City of Hamilton et al.	192
	Note	196
	Donald Piazezza Beauty Salon et al. v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	196
	Note	199
(v)	Public Hospitals, Highways, Municipal Property, Boy Scouts and Girl Guides and Industrial Farms	200
	Note	200
(vi)	Municipal Properties	201
	Note	201
	Toronto Transit Commission v. City of Toronto	201
	Note	203
(vii)	Charitable Institutions	204
	Note	204
	Re Ina Grafton Homes and Township of East York	204
	Assessment Commissioner of the Village of Stouffville v. Mennonite Home Association of York County	207
(viii)	Children's Aid Societies, Scientific or Literary Institutions and Battle Sites	212
	Note	212

(ix)	Machinery and Equipment Used for Manufacturing or Farming Purposes	212
	Note	212
	The City of London v. John Labatt Ltd.	212
	Note	215
(x)	The Interpretation of "Property Of"	215
	Note	215
	Re Royal Ontario Museum and Assessment Commissioner for Region No. 10 et al.	215
	Re Markham York Hospital et al and Town of Markham	220
(xi)	Exceptions to Certain Exemptions	221
	Note	221
(xii)	Municipal Exemptions	222
	Note	222
(xiii)	Bonuses	222
	Note	222
	Re Whitton and City of Ottawa	222
	Note	223
4.	Valuation of Property	224
(i)	Market Value	224
	Note	224
	Ward, Market Value Re-Assessment	224
	Montreal v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada	231
	Assessment Commissioner of the York Assessment Office v. Office Speciality Ltd.	243
(ii)	Equity	247
	Note	247
	Joint Committee on Property Tax Reform Interim Report: The Present Property Tax System	247
	Re Empire Realty Co. Ltd. and Assessment Commissioner for Metro Toronto	249
	Note	259
	Re York Condominium No. 26 551 The West Mall and Assessment Commissioner for the Borough of Etobicoke	259

Devald et al. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 16 et al. 263

Downtown Oshawa Property Owners' Association, Hovell Holdings Limited and Drew Estate v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region Number 13, The Corporation of the City of Ottawa 266

Note 270

Regional Assessment Commissioners Region No. 2 et al. v. Ontario Steel Products Co. Ltd. 270

Note 273

(iii) Special Provision for Farm Land 273

Note 273

(iv) Special Provisions for Reforested Lands, Wood Lands and Orchards 274

Note 274

(v) Special Provisions for Golf Courses 274

Note 274

(vi) Other Special Provisions 274

Note 274

5. Business Assessment 275

Note 275

(i) Liability for Business Assessment - Carrying on a Business 275

Note 275

Re Windsor-Essex County Real Estate Board and City of Windsor et al. 275

Note 278

Re Delta Parking Systems Ltd. and TWP of Toronto 278

Re Saga Canadian Management Services Ltd and City of Ottawa et al. 281

Note 290

Re United Trust Co. et al. and City of Toronto et al. 291

Re Plumbing Mart 294

(ii) Rate of Business Assessment 297

6. Appeals 298

Note 298

Downtown Churchworkers Association of the Anglican Church of Canada and Dioceses of Toronto v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 7 et al. 299

D. Local Improvements and Special Assessment 306

Note 306

E. Conclusion 307

Financing Development of Local Government in Ontario 307

Notes and Questions 308

Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 309

CHAPTER IV

JUDICIAL REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTIONS

Introduction 328

A. Constitutionality 329

McKay v. The Queen 329

R. v. Beattie 329

Regina v. Top Banada Ltd. 330

Note 330

B. Delegation 332

(i) To Employees 332

Russell v. The Corporation of Toronto 332

Regina v. Sandler 333

R. v. Campbell 336

(ii) To Council Committees 337

Simon v. Gastonguay et al. 337

R. v. Seminary 340

Re Davies and Village of Forest Hill 341

C. Express Authority 345

Morrison v. Kingston 345

Re Christie Taxi Ltd. and Doran 347

Note 349

Ottawa Electric Light Co. v. Corporation of Ottawa 349

Re Weir et al. and The Queen 350

Notes and Questions 353

Re Pride Cleaners and Dyers 354

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Voyageur Colonial Ltd. et al. 357

Questions 360

The Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto Recommendations 362

D. The Impact of Provincial Policy 364

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Township of Marlborough 364

Regina v. Morin 367

E. Unreasonableness 370

Kruse v. Johnson 370

F. Geographic Limitations 371

Note 371

R. v. Roy 372

Note 377

G. Discrimination 378

Re Bruce and Town of Cobourg 378

R. v. Donald B. Allen Ltd. 380

City of Ottawa v. Royal Trust Co. 382

City of Verdun v. Sun Oil Co. Ltd. 386

Atkinson v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 390

H. Bad Faith 392

Re Howard and City of Toronto 392

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 396

I. Technical Requirements 399

Re Whitton and City of Ottawa 399

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

PART II

CHAPTER V

INTRODUCTION TO PLANNING

Introduction 402

A. The Origins and Theory of Planning 403

J. Jocobs, The Death and Life of Great American Cities 403

Note 407

Principles and Prictice of Urban Planning 408

Note 420

Greenspan & Vaughan, "How the Zoning Game is Played: A Look at Land Use Procedures" 420

B. The Municipal Role in Planning and The Official Plan 422

(i) Introduction 422

Ontario Economic Council, Subject to Approval 422

Note 426

(ii) The Official Plan and Conformity 426

Note 426

Re Cadillac Development Corporation and City of Toronto 427

Holmes et al. v. Regional Municipalitiy of Halton 431

Notes and Questions 432

(iii) The Limits of Official Plans 434

Re Borough of Scarborough and the Minister of Housing for Ontario 433

(iv) Metropolitan or Regional Official Plans 438

Note 438

Campeau Corporation v. Township of Gloucester 438

C. The Provincial Role in Planning 442

Note 442

White, "Ontario's Land Use Legislation" 442

Note 446

Union Gas Ltd. v. Corporation of Dawn 446

CHAPTER VI

THE PRIVATE CONTROL OF LAND USES

Introduction 451

A. Restrictive Covenants 452

Tulk v. Moxhay 452

London County Council v. Allen 453

Stilwell v. Blackman 458

Shepherd Homes Ltd. v. Sandham 458

Earl of Leicester v. Wells U.D.C. 458

Wrothan Park Estate v. Parkside Homes 458

One Twenty-Five Varsity Road Ltd. v. Twp. of York 459

Re Sekretov and City of Toronto 463

Re Hart et al. and Harrietsfield-Grand Lake Community Association 467

Note 469

B. Building Schemes 470

Hyett, "Restrictive Covenants: An Appraisal of Building Schemes" 470

Megarry & Wade, The Law of Real Property 472

Scharf v. Mac'sMilk Ltd. 476

MacGregor et al. v. Boyd Builders Ltd. et al. 479

Re Lorne Park 486

Re Zierler 487

Shen Investments Ltd. v.Mosca 487

Texaco Antilles Ltd. v. Kernochan 488

C. Modification of Restrictive Covenants 489

Note 489

Re Beardmore 489

Re Beardsley's Application 492

D. Nuisance 493

Walker v. McKinnon Industries 493

Cairns v. Canada Refining & Smelting Co. 497

Gertsen v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 499

Spur Industries Inc. v. Del E. Webb Dev. Co. 502

Bottom v. Ontario Leaf Tobacco Co. Ltd. 505

CHAPTER VII

ZONING AND LAND USE CONTROL

Introduction 508

A. Introduction to Zoning 508

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 509

Note 510

B. The Scope of The Zoning Power 511

Note 511

(i) Exclusionary Zoning and the Scope of the Zoning Power 511

Village of Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co. 511

Note 516

R v. Brown Camps Ltd. 517

Notes and Questions 521

City of Barrie v. Brown Camps Residential and Day Schools 522

Notes and Questions 527

R v. Bell (Div. Ct.) 528

R v. Bell (O.C.A.) 531

R v. Bell (S.C.C.) 538

Notes and Questions 545

Note 546

Current Dilemmas and Legal Issues in Housing For All Under Law 546

Notes and Questions 552

C. Discrimination and Zoning 553

Note 553

City of Toronto v. Mandelbaum 553

Note 555

Scarborough Township v. Bond 555

Notes and Questions 558

H. G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York 559

Re Twp. of North York Restricted By-law 563

City of Ottawa v. Royal Trust Co. 566

Corporation of the City of Brampton 567

D. Bad Faith 568

Note 568

Re Cadillac Development Corp. and City of Toronto 568

Re Wall & Redekop Corp. Ltd. and City of Vancouver 572

Notes and Questions 574

City of Halifax v. Hollet et al. 574

H.G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York 579

E. The Administration of Zoning By-Laws 580

Polai v. City of Toronto 580

Notes and Questions 582

F. Prohibiting All Uses 582

R. v. Gibson Ex parte Cromiller 582

Corporation of the City of Coquitlan v. Karmanolis 583

G. Planning and Land Value 584

Note 584

Romanica v. Greater Winnipeg Water District 585

Belfast Corporation v. O.D. Cars Ltd. 589

Note 595

Regina Auto Court v. City of Regina 595

Re Simpson and City of Vancouver 597

Rodenbush v. Corporation of the District of North Cowichan 602

H. Negligence 605

Note 605

Wellbridge Holdings Ltd. v. Metropolitan Corporation of Greater Winnipeg 605

Bowen et al. v. City of Edmonton (No. 2) 609

CHAPTER VIII

ZONING REFORMS AND DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

Introduction 615

A. Limitations on Zoning 616

Note 616

Re Mississauga Golf and Country Club 616

Notes and Questions 619

Re O'Donnell and City of Belleville 619

Notes 621

Town of Uxbridge v. Timbers Brothers Sand and Gravel Ltd. 621

Note 623

Note 624

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 624

B. Reform of Zoning 629

Note 629

Soo Mill & Lumber Co. Ltd. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie 630

Sandybay Developments Ltd. v. City of London 634

Notes 637

Note 638

Papolis v. Corporation of the Borough of Scarborough 639

Note 641

Letter on Holding By-law and Development Control 641

Note 647

Re Walmar Investments and City of North Bay 648

Re Sorokalit & Mississauga 649

C. Section 35a of The Planning Act 654

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (Div. Ct.) 654

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (S.C.C.) 659

Notes and Questions 662

240953 Developments Ltd. et al. v. Corporation of the City of Hamilton 663

Note 664

Re City of Toronto By-law 234/75 664

City of Toronto Planning Board Report 667

Note 670

"Not at a Council's Whim", The Globe & Mail 670

Note 671

D. Section 37a of The Planning Act 672

Note 672

A.W. Banfield Construction Ltd. v. City of Oshawa 672

E. Lot Levies 675

Hudec, "Municipal Exactions and the Subdivision Approval Process: A Legal and Economic Analysis 675

Note 683

Re Mills and Land Division Committee of York 684

Notes and Questions 687

Re Steel Co. of Canada and City of Nanticoke 687

Pinetree Development Co. Ltd. v. Minister of Housing for Ontario 692

Re Frey and Regional Municipality of Peel Land Division Committee 696

Re Glenwo th Homes 705

CHAPTER IX

PRE-EXISTING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

Introduction 708

A. Ontario 709

(i) The Basic Rule 709

Note 709

City of Ottawa v. Boyd Builders 710

Note 715

(ii) A Pre-existing Intent 716

Note 716

Re Ove comers Church and City of Toronto 716

Note 721

Note 722

R. v. ity of Barrie Ex parte Bernick 72

	Notes and Questions	726
	Re Donald Bye Excavating Co. Ltd. et al. and City of Peterborough	726
(iii)	Good Faith	729
	Note	729
	Re Cambridge Leaseholds and City of Toronto (No. 2)	729
	Note	733
	Hall v. City of Toronto and Hadley	734
(iv)	Proceeding with Dispatch	740
	Rethazy et al. v. Corporation of the Town of Lincoln	740
	Note	743
	Re 261532 Development Corp. Ltd. and City of Toronto	743
(v)	The Application Itself	744
	Note	744
	Re David Galle Building Co. Ltd. and City of Toronto	744
(vi)	Other Jurisdictions	750
	Note	750
	(i) Nova Scotia	750
	Re Governors of Dalhousie College & University and City of Halifax	750
	Charter v. City of Dartmouth	751
	(ii) British Columbia	751
	Monarch Holdings Ltd. v. Oak Bay	751

CHAPTER X

CONTINUING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS NON-CONFORMING USES

Introduction 756

Note 757

(i) Defining the Uses 757

Central Jewish Institute v. Toronto 757

Note 760

Regina v. Rutherford's Dairy Ltd. 760

Note 762

(ii) Extension or Enlargement of Buildings 763

Re Wilmont andKingston 763

Notes 768

(iii) Changing Uses 768

Regina ex rel. Skimmings v. Cappy 768

(iv) Abandonment of Uses 770

Gayford v. Kolodziej et al. 770

O'Sullivan Funeral Home Ltd. v. Corporation of the City of Sault Ste Marie 771

Notes 772

(v) Amortization of Uses 773

Note 773

City of Los Angeles v. Gage 773

Note 776

(vi) Other Jurisdictions 776

Note 776

CHAPTER XI

PROCESS REQUIREMENTS AND THE MUNICIPALITY

Introduction 777

A. Access to Information 778

Makuch, Jackson, Freedom of Information in Local Government in Ontario 778

Notes 786

B. Right to a Hearing 787

Note 787

(i) Municipal Councils, Police Commissions, and Boards of Education 787

Atkinson et al. v. The Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 787

Notes 790

Re Zadrevec and Town of Brampton 791

Re Maple Leaf Mills and Point Edward 796

(ii) Planning Boards 799

Note 799

Re Florence Nightengale Home and Scarborough Planning Board 799

Re Cummer-Yonge Investments Ltd. and A. C. Ontario et al. 802

Note 809

(iii) Ministers Orders 809

Re Orangeville Highlands and A.G. of Ontario 809

Notes 812

(iv) Subdivision Agreements 813

Re Maurice Rollins Construction Ltd. and Township of South Fredricksburg 813

(v) Committee of Adjustment and Land Division Committees 813

Note 813

(vi) Nature of the Hearing Required 814
Re McMartin et al. v. City of Vancouver 814
Re Bourque 819
Notes 820
(vii) The Ontario Municipal Board 821
Note 821

CHAPTER XII

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTION

Introduction 824
Note 825

A. The Jurisdiction of the Ontario Municipal Ontario 825
Re Township of North York Restricted By-law 825

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 827
Notes 827

Re Merrens et al. and Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 828

B. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Courts View 831

Note 831

(i) Members Values 831
Re Vaughan Planning Area Official Plan Amendment 831
Note 834
(ii) Government Policy 834
Re Township of Caledon Official Plan 834
Notes and Questions 837

(iii) Good Planning Principles 838
Re Lord Nelson Hotel 838
Note 843

(iv) Financial & Economic Concerns 843
Re East York By-law 7633 843
Re Etobicoke By-law 14508 846
Note 851

(v) Land Value on Planning 851
Re McGregor and Scarborough 852
Forum: The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment in 1974 Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures 856
Notes and Questions 857

(vi) Minority Rights 857
Re Toronto Restricted Area By-Law 348-73 857
Notes 865
Jowell, "The Limits of the Public Hearing as a Tool of Urban Planning" 868

C. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Court's View 876
Notes 876
Re Cloverdale Shopping Centre Ltd. and Township of Etobicoke 876
Notes 883
Re Hopedale Developments Ltd. and Town of Oakville 884
Notes 888
Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespera et al. 889

D. Petitions to Cabinet 900
Notes 900
Statement by the Prime Minister of Ontario re the Spadina Expressway 900

E. Who Should Made Planning Decisions? 904

Tollefson v. Township of Gloucester 904

Notes 905

Forum: The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment 906